

Evidence Brief 3: Sovereign Risk Pools*

What are sovereign risk pools (SRP)?

We have all heard of parametric insurance and of risk pooling. Sovereign risk pools combine the use of these two important concepts in risk management. Parametric insurance is a type of insurance that 'pays out when modelled losses reach certain predetermined triggers, as opposed to traditional indemnity insurance that pays out based on actual losses' (Martinez-Diaz, Sidner, and McClamrock 2019). Examples of triggers are a hurricane of determined magnitude or an earthquake of a particular magnitude. Risk pooling refers to the spreading of financial risks evenly among a large number of contributors. Through sovereign risk pools, "countries can pool risks in a diversified portfolio, retain some of the risk through joint reserves and capital, and transfer excess risk to the reinsurance and capital markets" (World Bank 2017).

In 2007, the Caribbean Catastrophe Risk Insurance Facility (CCRIF) was the first multi-country risk pool and the first insurance instrument to successfully develop parametric policies backed by both traditional and capital markets. The Africa Risk Capacity (ARC) followed in 2012, the Pacific Catastrophe Risk Insurance Company (PCRIC) in 2016, and the Southeast Asia Disaster Risk Insurance Facility (SEADRIF) in 2018. In addition to risk pools, governments have a range of other disaster risk finance tools available to them (for more information see the <u>macro policy solutions</u> evidence brief).

Evidence around SRP

There is very limited systematic analysis about sovereign risk pools. The main findings can be summarized as follows:

- Recently, the World Resources Institute (WRI) published a paper examining three questions: (i) To what extent are countries deploying multiple disaster risk financing instruments to cover the various layers of risk?, (ii) To what extent are governments taking advantage of disaster risk insurance solutions and why?, and (iii) To what extent are disaster risk insurance pools supporting governments in their efforts to protect poor and vulnerable people? Their findings suggest that (i) only a few countries appear to be following a risk-layering approach; (ii) despite the unique value propositions of SRPs, there are several barriers to its uptake including costs, managing unmet expectations, and the limited understanding of parametric insurance; and (iii) CCRIF, ARC and PCRIC have different mandates in terms of protecting the poor and most vulnerable people. Only ARC has the explicit mandate to support them. To date, no evidence of impact on the poor has been documented. (Martinez-Diaz, Sidner, and McClamrock 2019)
- The UK Government's Department for International Development (DFID) commissioned the Independent Evaluation of the African Risk Capacity from 2015 to 2024. To date, only the results of their first formative evaluation have been published (Scott et al. 2017; Oxford

^{* ©} MCII 2020

This Evidence Brief was written by Marcela Tarazona as an input into the *From Innovation to Learning:* Creating a CDRFI Evidence Roadmap workshop. The author would like to acknowledge colleagues from MCII for their support.



- Policy Management 2017a; 2017b). The evaluation team of Oxford Policy Management (OPM) is currently collecting baseline data for an impact evaluation in Senegal¹, which results are expected to be available later in 2020.
- Published earlier in 2020, Insuring against Climate Change: The Emergence of Regional
 Catastrophe Risk Pools (Scherer 2020) provides a systematic study of CRIF, ARC and PCRIC.
 The book analyses the goals and characteristics of SRPs; their genesis; compares their
 characteristics and histories and zooms into their commonalities.
- In an extensive review of the literature, Schaefer and Waters (2016) state there is strong evidence (based on proper impact evaluation) that CCRIF, ARC and PCRAFI have a positive impact on catalysing risk assessments.
- According to Hillier (2018), macro- and meso-insurance models seem to offer potential to increase resilience, but more efforts are needed to ensure that payouts reach the poor and vulnerable.
- There are a few proposed frameworks for different purposes: Clarke and Dercon (2016)
 developed a methodology to allow quantitative analysis of the full economic cost of
 sovereign DRF strategies, which might include SRPs. But no specific framework to assess SRP
 has been developed.
- There is come anecdotal documentation that sovereign risk pools have reached government faster than international aid (see references to reports by ARC and the WB).

Gaps and research needs

SRPs are relatively new and there is very limited evidence base. A full agenda of research could be developed. A few key questions include: Are SRPs reaching the intended beneficiaries? If so, what is the impact they are having on their welfare? How to measure basis risk? How to reduce it? How to improve the transparency of the models used to trigger?

References

Clarke, Daniel J., and Stefan Dercon. 2016. "Dull Disasters? How Planning Ahead Will Make a Difference." *Asia-Pacific Journal of Rural Development* 26 (2). https://doi.org/10.1177/1018529120160206.

Hillier, Debbie. 2018. Facing Risk: Options and Challenges in Ensuring That Climate/Disaster Risk Finance and Insurance Deliver for Poor People. Oxfam International. https://doi.org/10.21201/2017.2258.

Martinez-Diaz, Leonardo, Lauren Sidner, and Jack McClamrock. 2019. "The Future of Disaster Risk Pooling for Developing Countries: Where Do We Go from Here?" http://www.wri.org/publication/disaster-risk-pooling.

Oxford Policy Management. 2017a. "Independent Evaluation of the African Risk Capacity: Annex A: Global Review - Baseline Context." Oxford. https://www.africanriskcapacity.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/Formative-Phase-1-ARC-Evaluation_merged.pdf.

———. 2017b. "Independent Evaluation of the African Risk Capacity: Formative Phase 1 Report." Oxford. https://www.opml.co.uk/files/Publications/a0603-independent-evaluation-african-risk-capacity/arc-evaluation-report.pdf?noredirect=1.

¹ In November 2019, Senegal received a payout of US\$23.1 million from ARC Limited. US\$12.5 million was given to the Government and US\$10.6 million to StartNetwork to assist in providing early action to support the people affected by drought during the 2019 agricultural season.



- Schaefer, Laura, and Eleanor Waters. 2016. "Climate Risk Insurance for the Poor: How to Effectively Implement the Pro-Poor Focus of InsuResilience." https://climate-insurance.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/MCII_2016_CRI_for_the_Poor_and_Vulnerable_full_study_lo-res-2.pdf.
- Scherer, Nikolas. 2020. *Insuring Against Climate Change: The Emergence of Regional Catastrophe Risk Pools*. Abingdon, Oxon; New York, NY: Routledge, 2020. | Series: Routledge advances in climate change research | Updated revision of the author's PhD thesis.: Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429324642.
- Scott, Zoë, Claire Simon, Jesse McConnell, and Paula Silva Villanueva. 2017. "Independent Evaluation of African Risk Capacity: Final Inception Report." Oxford. https://www.opml.co.uk/files/Publications/a0603-independent-evaluation-african-risk-capacity/arc-evaluation-annex-f-inception.pdf?noredirect=1.
- World Bank. 2017. "What Makes Catastrophe Risk Pools Work: Lessons for Policymakers." 2017. https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2017/11/14/what-makes-catastrophe-risk-pools-work.

Additional literature

- African Development Bank (ADB). 2019. "Annual Report 2018. Emergency Assistance Special Relief Fund". Available at: https://www.afdb.org/en/documents/annual-report-2018-emergency-assistance-special-relief-fund.
- ADB. 2019b. "Disaster Risk Financing Needs." In "Pacific Disaster Resilience Program (Phase 2): Disaster Risk Financing Needs." Manila: Asian Development Bank. www.adb.org/sites/default/files/linked- documents/50028-002-sd-01.pdf.
- African Risk Capacity (ARC). 2016. African Risk Capacity Strategic Framework 2016-2020. Available at: https://www.africanriskcapacity.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/PI_Strategic-Framework-2016-2020_20161207_EN_TA.pdf.
- ARC. 2017a. "African Risk Capacity: Response to ActionAid's Flawed Claims." July 10. African Risk Capacity. www.africanriskcapacity.org/2017/07/10/african-risk-capacity-response-to-actionaids-flawed-claims.
- ARC. 2017b. Lessons Learned: Implementation of a Sovereign Risk Management and Insurance Mechanism. Johannesburg: African Risk Capacity. www.africanriskcapacity.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/ARC_LessonsLearned.pdf.
- Blampied, C. 2016. "Weathering a Risky Climate. The Role of Insurance in reducing Vulnerability to Extreme Weather". London, UK. Available at: https://www.results.org.uk/sites/default/files/files/Weathering%20a%20Risky%20Climate.pdf.
- Cabot Venton, C., C. Fitzgibbon, T. Shitarek, L. Coulter, and O. Dooley. 2012. "The Economics of Early Response and Disaster Resilience: Lessons from Kenya and Ethiopia." Economics of Resilience Final Report. https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/67330/Econ-Ear-Rec-Res-Full-Report 20.pdf.
- CCRIF (Caribbean Catastrophic Risk Insurance Facility Segregated Portfolio Company). 2017. CCRIF SPC Annual Report 2016–2017. Cayman Islands. CCRIF SPC. https://www.ccrif.org/sites/default/files/publications/CCRIFSPC_ Annual_Report_2016_2017.pdf.



- CCRIF. 2018a. "CCRIF SPC: About Us." CCRIF SPC. www.ccrif.org/content/ about-us.
- CCRIF. 2018b. CCRIF SPC Annual Report 2017-2018. Grand Cayman: CCRIF SPC. www.ccrif.org/sites/default/files/publications/CCRIF_Annual_ Report_2017_2018_0.pdf.
- CCRIF. 2019a. "Over 2 Million Persons Benefit Directly or Indirectly from CCRIF Payouts: A Synopsis of How Governments Have Used CCRIF Payouts 2007–2018." CCRIF SPC. www.ccrif.org/sites/default/files/publications/ Synopsis-How-Governments-have-used-CCRIF-Payouts-February2019.pdf.
- Clarke, D. 2017. "Concessional sovereign disaster insurance: Background paper for the InsuResilience Working Group on Concessional Climate Risk Insurance". Government Actuary's Department.
- Clarke, D., and R.V. Hill. 2012. Cost-Benefit Analysis of the African Risk Capacity Facility. www.africanriskcapacity.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/ Cost-Benefit-Analysis-of-African-Risk-Capacity-Facility.pdf.
- DFID (Department for International Development). 2018. "Pacific Catastrophe Risk Assessment and Financing Initiative." Annual Review. London: Department for International Development. https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-205266/documents.
- DFID. 2014. "African Risk Capacity, Business Case". London, UK. Available at https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-203469/documents.
- DFID. 2019. "African Risk Capacity, Annual Review". London, UK. Available at https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-203469/documents.
- Dlugolecki, A., R. Mechler, and R. Kalra. 2013. "Caribbean Catastrophe Risk Insurance Facility (CCRIF): An Independent Review in 2012 Commissioned by DFID and CIDA."
- Farhat et al. 2017. Evaluation of the Kenya Hunger Safety Net Programme Phase 2: Emergency Payments Deep Dive Study. Oxford: Oxford Policy Management.

 https://www.opml.co.uk/projects/evaluation-kenya-hunger-safety-net-programme-hsnp.
- Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development. 2017. "A Marshall Plan with Africa". Available at: https://www.bmz.de/en/countries_regions/marshall_plan_with_africa/index.html.
- Kreft, S., Schaefer, L., Behre, E. and Matias, D. 2017. "Climate risk insurance for resilience: Assessing countries' implementation plans". Report. UNU-EHS. Available at: https://collections.unu.edu/view/UNU:6321.
- Ghesquiere, F. and Mahul, O. 2010. "Financial Protection of the State against Natural Disasters: A Primer". Policy Research Working Paper; No. WPS 5429. World Bank. Available at: https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/3912.
- GIZ. 2017b. "Risk Transfer and Insurance for Disaster Risk Management: Evidence and Lessons Learned." Review paper for a special session on risk transfer and insurance at the 5th Global Platform for Disaster Risk Reduction, by F. Le Quesne. Bonn. www.unisdr.org/files/globalplatform/591d4f658e046R isk_transfer_and_insurance_for_disaster_risk_management_evidence_ and_lessons_learned.pdf.



- InsuResilience Global Partnership. 2019. "InsuResilience Global Partnership Vision 2025". Available at: https://www.insuresilience.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/InsuResilience-Global-Partnership_Vision-2025-with-Workplan1.pdf.
- Richards, J.aA and Shalatek, L. 2018. "Not a Silver Bullet. Why the Focus on Insurance to Address Loss and Damage is a Distraction from real Solutions". Washington, DC. Available at: https://us.boell.org/sites/default/files/not a silver bullet 1.pdf.
- Spearing, 2019. "IDA'S Crisis Response Window: Learning Lessons to Drive Change." Centre for Disaster Protection. Discussion Paper. London, UK. Available at: https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5c9d3c35ab1a62515124d7e9/t/5d9db406d1d15b27de 921d58/1570616479892/Paper_3_IDAs_Crisis_Response_Window.pdf.
- UNFCCC. 2013. "Report of the Conference of the Parties on its eighteenth session, held in Doha from 26 November to 8 December 2012". Available at: https://unfccc.int/resource/docs/2012/cop18/eng/08a01.pdf.
- van Aalst, M, J.K., Pichon, F. and Mitchell, T. 2013. "Incentives in Disaster Risk Management and Humanitarian Response". Background note for World Development Report 2014.
- World Bank. 2018. "Disaster Risk Finance: A Primer Core Principles and Operational Framework". Available at: https://www.financialprotectionforum.org/publication/disaster-risk-finance-a-primercore-principles-and-operational-framework.
- World Bank. 2019. "This Is What It's All About: Building Resilience and Adapting to Climate Change in Africa". Available at: https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2019/03/07/this-is-what-its-all-about-building-resilience-and-adapting-to-climate-change-in-africa.
- World Bank. 2008. "A Review of CCRIF's Operation after Its First Season." Washington, DC: World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/950621468012033584/pdf/664010WP00PUBL0operation0dec0102008.pdf.
- World Bank. 2012a. "Grant to the Caribbean Catastrophe Risk Insurance Facility for a Caribbean Catastrophe Risk Insurance Project." Implementation Completion and Results Report ICR00002332. Washington, DC: World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/733451468225588956/pdf/ ICR23320P1080500disclosure070270120.pdf.
- World Bank. 2012b. "Pacific Catastrophe Risk Insurance Project."

 Project Information Document, Appraisal Stage. Report No. 73102. Washington, DC: World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/956091468063254565/pdf/731020PID0P133001200Pacific0Islands.pdf.
- World Bank. 2013. "Pacific Catastrophe Risk Assessment and Financing Initiative SOPAC Project." Project Information Document, Appraisal Stage. Washington, DC: World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/371751468291651878/pdf/815520PID0P13200September01900final.pdf.
- World Bank. 2015a. "Central America and Caribbean Catastrophe Risk Insurance Program Multidonor Trust Fund Grant Agreement between International Bank for Reconstruction and Development and CCRIF SPC." CCRIF TF Grant No. TF0A0564. Washington, DC: World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/894501468045859823/pdf/RAD1001409807.pdf.



- World Bank. 2015b. "Proposed Grant to CCRIF SPC for a Central America and Caribbean Catastrophe Risk Insurance Project." Project Appraisal Document PAD976. Washington, DC: World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/981641467993158673/Latin-America-Central-America-and- Caribbean-Catastrophe-Risk-Insurance-Project.
- World Bank. 2015c. Pacific Catastrophe Risk Insurance Pilot: From Design to Implementation—Some Lessons Learned. Washington, DC: World Bank.

 https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/Pacific_ Catastrophe_Risk_Insurance-Pilot_Report_140715%281%29.pdf.
- World Bank. 2017d. "Sovereign Climate and Disaster Risk Pooling: World Bank Technical Contribution to the G20." Washington, DC: World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/837001502870999632/pdf/118676-WP- v2-PUBLIC.pdf.